

AN IN-DEPTH EXAMINATION OF IN-TEXT CITATIONS IN UNDERGRADUATE PROJECTS: A CASE STUDY FROM KABALE UNIVERSITY

Benjamin Bahimbisibwe and Noreen Rugambwa

Department of Library and Information Science, Faculty of Computing, Library and information Sciences, Kabale University Kabale, Uganda.

Abstract: *In-text citation is a critical facet of scholarly research, playing a pivotal role in the construction of a comprehensive and robust literature review. This practice entails acknowledging and referencing all sources cited within the body of a research work, reflecting an ethical and scholarly commitment to recognizing the contributions of prior works. In this context, the distinction between citation and referencing is elucidated, with the former focusing on acknowledging sources within the text, while the latter pertains to the systematic attribution of ideas, theories, quotes, facts, and other supporting evidence in academic assignments, papers, seminars, dissertations, and theses. Scholarly communication relies on various referencing styles, and this paper explores the significance and nuances of two prevalent citation systems: Harvard Referencing and the American Psychological Association (APA) style. While multiple referencing styles exist globally, Harvard Referencing and APA stand out as popular choices in academic writing, depending on the discipline. The selection of a particular citation style is often driven by the conventions of the academic community and the subject matter of the research.*

Citation styles serve as standardized frameworks for attributing and acknowledging sources used in research papers or assignments. Notably, the choice of a citation style is often mandated by the specific program or degree being pursued, reflecting the need for uniformity and consistency within academic writing. This paper delves into the intricacies of the APA citation style, shedding light on its applicability in Social Sciences, education, and related fields. Furthermore, it introduces alternative style options such as the Modern Language Association (MLA), Council of Science Editors (CSE), and Vancouver, offering a comprehensive overview of the diverse referencing landscape available to researchers.

Keywords: *In-text citation, referencing, citation styles, Harvard Referencing, American Psychological Association (APA), scholarly communication.*

Introduction

In-text citation is an important area of research and a hallmark of a good and robust literature review. In text citation encompasses all cited sources in the body of a research; an act of acknowledging all sources cited in the body of the research during the review of literature. Traditionally, when carrying out a research, reference is made to other works that are useful to the research by citing and acknowledging where such information is obtained. This is different from referencing. Referencing according to Shibly (2016), is a system used in the academic community to indicate where ideas,

theories, quotes, facts and any other evidence and information used to undertake an assignment, term paper, seminar, dissertation and thesis can be found. There are many types of referencing style that are globally used, but most popular in the academic writing works are: Harvard Referencing and Citation, American Psychological.

Association (APA) depending on the discipline. Accordingly, NAIT Library (2018) posits that, citation styles are standardized systems for crediting and citing sources used in a research paper or assignment. Consequently, the program or degree will require a student to use a specific citation style. The American Psychological Association (APA) citation style is one of many diverse citation styles applied in Social Sciences, education and related disciplines. Other style options include: Modern Language Association (MLA), Counsel of Science Editors (CSE) and Vancouver (NAIT Library, 2018).

The word referencing describes references to cited documents given in a list at the end of the text, usually described as bibliographic references. In the Harvard System, the references are listed in alphabetical order of authors' surnames and if the author has been cited more than once by a specific author, they should be listed chronologically (earliest first) followed by the later e.g. (1993a, 1993b) or if more than one item has been published during a specific year and whenever possible, elements of a bibliographical reference should be taken from the title page of the publication (Shibly, 2016).

In-text citation, an aspect of citation analysis that concerns citations in the body of research work. However, most citation works or researches are mainly on citation count, which is the analysis of citations in the reference section of any research work. Citation according to Prytherch and Prytherch (1995) is the reference to a text or part of a text identifying the document in which it may be found. Shibly (2016), also notes that citation is the part of the reference that is included within the main body of a research work at any level of research whenever an author is directly quoted, paraphrased, summarized or refer to work produced by another author. It is worthy to note that, it is good practice to change or differ in the way one incorporates in-text citations. This will help enhance the flow and method of academic writing. The writer may occasionally use the author's name in the text or just refer to the author in brackets and citations might appear at the start, middle or end of the sentences. In some instances, one can refer to multiple sources and this will not only help to make the writing more concise, but will develop the synthesis of sources, research or ideas within the assignments (Shibly, 2016).

Chikate and Patil (2008), also submit that "citation analysis refers to references in one text to another text, with information on where that text can be found". This definition depicts that citation is both in text citations and references, because citations appear in two sections in a research work, which includes the body of the work; and reference section which is sometimes referred to as bibliography or footnote depending on the nature of the authority and style of citation adopted in the research. Citation can also appear in library materials like abstracts, indexes and subject bibliographies. Citation is also used synonymously with the term bibliographic reference and is consequently taken to represent the analysis of bibliographic references, which form part of the apparatus of scholarly communication (Jeppe, 2008).

One common phenomenon in most research on citation analysis is on references in a research, bibliographies and abstracting and indexing services rather than citations embedded on academic research. The above situation is clear in a research by Swales (1986) that "Citation analysis is something of a misnomer, in that it usually describes studies of bibliographical references, rather than studies of

citations embedded in continuous academic text. Although such reference studies go back at least fifty years, they were undoubtedly given impetus by the appearance of the Institute for Scientific Information Science Citation Index in 1961 and by the availability of the computer tapes on which the index is based. Since then, of course, the ISI has added the Social Sciences citation Index and more recently the Arts and Humanities Citation Index". Swales, believed that citation analysis is supposed to be all inclusive of in-text citation, reference, bibliography and abstracting and indexing services. This deficiency could have emanated from the fact that early citation researches were focused on citation count.

Citation analysis entail the building and application of a series of indicators of the impact, influence or quality of scholarly work derived from citation data such as data on references cited in footnotes or bibliographies of scholarly research publications. Such indicators are applied both in the study of scholarly communication and in the assessment of research performance (Meod, 2005). Citation analysis is an effective tool but it has limitations. MacRoberts and MacRoberts (1989) stated that "most authors simply did not cite the majority of their influences, and none cited all influences". Graduate students may include references even if a work is marginal or irrelevant to their theses (Sylvia, 1998). In turn, students may not cite important research if it is not published in their native language or cannot be found locally (MacRoberts & MacRoberts, 1989; Sylvia, 1998). Budd (1986) asserted that the use of citation analysis in the practice of collection management in the humanities is still something questionable and concluded that references to books are very diffuse.

The most frequently cited primary monograph and secondary monograph are identified and compared with standard lists and other citation studies. Studies that focus on in-text citation are scanty, whereas in-text citation and reference are the hub variable that determines proper research. An in-text citation appears in parentheses within the text of a paper, in order to indicate that a source is being cited.

In-text citations include the author's last name and the publication date. If the author's name is already given in the text of the paper, then it is not given again inside the parentheses. Boyack, Eck, Colavizza, and Waltman (2017) report the characteristics of in-text citations in over five million full text articles from two large databases the PubMed Central Open Access subset and Elsevier journals as functions of time, textual progression, and scientific field. The purpose of this study is to understand the characteristics of in-text citations in a detailed way prior to pursuing other studies focused on answering more substantive research questions. As such, we have analyzed in-text citations in several ways and report many findings here. Perhaps most significantly, we find that there are large field-level differences that are reflected in position within the text, citation interval (or reference age), and citation counts of references.

McCain and Turner (1989) cited in Boyack, Eck, Colavizza, and Waltman (2017) studied a set of 11 highly cited papers, created an index based on citing location, number of in-text citations, citation utility from citation contexts, and self-citation. They found that papers with a later citation peak (at six years) were more broadly useful than those with an early citation peak in the same vain citations to papers with a later citation peak were more often for methodological advances rather than for experimental results or theoretical concepts. There are different research and results on in-text citation. In-text citations there are little tags that quickly show the reader where to find the information quoted, summarized, or paraphrased. Every in-text citation corresponds to the source's full citation, which is listed at the end of the paper in the reference page (<https://www.jcu.edu.sg> > __data > assets > pdf_file).

Furthermore, in-text citations give recognition to the authors and ideas that are used in a paper. It also helps the reader find the full source citation in the references page (s). With in-text citations and references page, reader can see how well the researcher integrated research into the paper (https://www.jcu.edu.sg/_data/assets/pdf_file).

According to Taylor and Francis (2018), standard reference style like APA references are widely used in the social sciences, education, engineering and business. It's a standard tool for in-text citation and reference. A detailed example can be found in the publication manual of the American Psychological Association, Sixth Edition (2010); <http://www.apastyle.org/> and <http://blog.apastyle.org/>. However, a corresponding Endnote output style can be downloaded from <http://endnote.com/downloads/styles> by searching for the style named T&F Standard APA. The University of Toledo (nd) also opines that APA style uses the author/date method of citation in which the author's last name and the year of the publication are inserted in the actual text of the paper. It is the style suggested by the APA and used mainly in the social sciences. Currently, the APA addresses new electronic formats in a separate guide, which undergraduates and other students in the globe can access in book format or online through the library. Several of the examples in this guide come from one of these sources. The American Psychological Association offers some guidance and examples at <http://www.apastyle.org/> (The University of Toledo, (nd). Additionally, The Writing Center (Carlson), also offers help to students who are writing papers. For full information, please consult the two APA guides below.

BF 76.7. P83 2001 REF (available in reference and reserves at Carlson Library) publication manual of the American Psychological Association (5th ed.); BF 76.7. P833 2007 REF (available in reference or at <http://utmost.cl.utoledo.edu/record=b2574984>) APA Style Guide to Electronic References by The American Psychological Association (The University of Toledo, nd).

Objectives of the study

The objectives of the study included:

1. To determine number of in text citations in the sampled students' undergraduate research projects for the period of 2015 to 2019.
2. To determine number of in text citations sources per library materials.
3. To determine the number of citations per programmes.
4. To determine the number of citations that conforms to American Psychological Association (APA) in text citation style.
5. To determine number of in text citations not in conformity to American Psychological Association (APA) in text citation style.

Methodology

Seventy five (75) students' research reports were randomly selected from the Bachelor of Library and information science (BLIS) and Bachelor of Records Management (BRIM) programmes. The researches were done between the periods of 2015 to 2019.

Fifteen (15) student's researches reports were randomly selected each year and a total of two thousand five hundred and sixty four (2,564) in text citations were found in the research report. This also formed the data for the study. All the in-text citations were extracted and grouped to ascertain whether they conform to APA or not and were analyzed using simple percentage.

Presentation of findings

The findings were presented using simple tables based on the objectives of the study as below.

Table 1. In-text citation analysis of numbers of projects and citations by year

Year	No. of projects	No. of citations
2015	15	366
2016	15	294
2017	15	478
2018	15	684
2019	15	742
Total		2,564

Table 1 above reveals the numbers of students' projects report by year and numbers citations by year. Findings from table 1 show the highest numbers of citation was 742 in 2019, 684 in 2018, 478 in 2017 and 366 in 2015 while the lowest was 294 in 2016.

Table II. In-text citation sources and number of citations per library materials

Library resources	No. of citations	Percentage (%)
Books	766	29.9
Journals	1,108	43.2
Reference materials	149	5.8
E-resources	388	15.1
Newspapers/Magazines	74	2.9
Conference proceedings	50	2.0
Unpublished research projects	29	1.1
Total	2,564	100.0

Table II shows in-text citations sources and the number of citations per library materials. Journals had the highest numbers of citations with 1,108 (43.3%), books 766 (29.9%), e-resources 388 (15.1), Reference materials 149 (5.8%), Newspapers/ Magazines 74 (2.9%), conference proceedings 50 (2.0) and unpublished research projects 29 (1.1) respectively. From the table above the library material cited most is Journals, books and e-resources respectively.

Table III. In-text citations per Programme

Programme	No. of citations	Percentage (%)
Bachelor of Library and information science (BLIS)	845	67.0
Bachelor of Records Management (BRIM)	766	33.0

Total	2,564	100.0
-------	-------	-------

Table III reveals in text citation per programme. The Bachelor of Library and Information Sciences (BLIS) had 845 (67.00%) in text citations while Bachelor of Records Management had 766 (33.0%) citations respectively. From the above table, BLIS had the highest number of citations in their research.

Table IV. In-text citations in conformity with APA

Programme	No. citations	of Conformity
Bachelor of Library and information science (BLIS)	1,719	436
Bachelor of Records Management (BRIM)	845	241
Total	2,564	677

Table IV shows the citations in conformity with American Psychological Association (APA) by department. Bachelor of Library and Information (BLIS) programme had 1,719 citations with 436 in conformity with APA citation style while Bachelor of Records Management (BRIM) with 845 citations and 241 only conformed to APA citation style. From the table it's obvious that students in both programmes do not have a total understanding of the American Psychological Association (APA) citation style adopted by the departments

Table V. In Text Citations not in Conformity with APA

Programme	No. of Citations	None Conformity
Bachelor of Library and Information Science (BLIS)	1,719	1,283
Bachelor of Records Management (BRIM)	845	604
Total	2,564	1,887

Table V shows that Bachelor of Library and Information Science (BLIS) research had a total of 1,719 numbers of citations, out of which 1,283 did not conform to American Psychological Association (APA) in text citation style. In the same vein, Bachelor of Records Management (BRIM) had 845 numbers of citations, 604 of the in text citation did not conform to American Psychological Association (APA) in text citation style. The implication from the analysis is that the students lack the knowledge of proper utilization of the American Psychological Association American Psychological Association (APA) in text citations style.

Discussions of findings

The study examined 2,564 in text citations from 75 students' projects report domiciled in the Department of Library and Information Science. From the findings, students' had the highest number of in text citations in 2019. The study also found that journals had the highest number of citations followed by books. What that means is that students had more in-text citations from journal and book sources. The study also revealed that of the programmes in the Department of Library and Information

Science, Bachelor of Library and Information Sciences (BLIS) students' projects report has highest number of in-text citations in their research works. The study found that Bachelor of Library and information science (BLIS) students' project had 1,719 in-text citation and only 436 in-text citations conform to APA style. Bachelor of Records Management (BRIM) students' projects had 845 in-text citations and only 242 in-text citations conform to APA style. The implication is that students" don't have the mastery APA style of referencing and in-text citations.

Finally, the study found that majority of the students' in-text citations did not conform to APA style of in-text citations. Bachelor of Library and information science (BLIS) student's projects report had 1,719 in-text citations. Of these, 1,283 did not conform to APA style. While Bachelor of Records Management (BRIM) student's projects report had 845 in text citations; out of these 604 did not conform to APA style. Again, this was an indication that students did not have knowledge of the usage of APA in text citation style.

Conclusion and Recommendations

The study of citation analysis of undergraduate projects in the department of Library and Information Science at Kabale University, Uganda was carried out. Focus was mainly on in-text citation. Consequently, it was established that from the period covering 2015 to 2019 that students' had the highest number of in-text citations in their research in 2019. The study also established that student's concentrated on the use of information from journals and books in text citations. However, most of their citations did not conform to APA style of in-text citation. The implication is that students did not have the mastery of the APA in text citation style.

The researchers therefore recommended that students should be given in-depth knowledge including hands-on exercises to master the art of APA application in text citation. This will encouraged them to master the use of APA in their research works given that it is the approved reference and in text citations style in the Department.

References

Boyack, K.W., Eck,N.J., Colavizza,G and Waltman,M. L. (2017). Characterizing in-text citations in scientific

articles: A large-scale analysis.Journal of informatics. Retrieved on the 2nd of January, 2020 from <https://openaccess.leidenuniv>1-s20-s1751157717303516-main T pdf>

Buddy, J. (1986). Characteristics of written scholarship in Americans literature: A citation study. Library and Information Science Research. Vol. 8. No. 2. Retrieved from www.semanticscholar.org.

Chikate, R.V. and Patil, S.K. (2008). Citation Analysis of Theses in Library and Information Science Submitted to University of Pune : A Pilot Study. Library Philosophy and Practice.

Jeppe, N. (2008). Citation Analysis. Annual Review of Information Science Technology, 41 (1) . Retrieved on the 2nd of January 2020 from <https://asistdl.onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1002/aris.2007.1440410120>

MacRoberts, M.H and MacRoberts, B.R. (2010). *Problems of Citation Analysis: A Study of Uncited and Seldom-Cited Influences*. JASIST,. Retrieved from <http://image.Sciencenet.cn>kexue.com>

Meod, H.F. (2005). New developments in the use of citation analysis in research evaluation. *Archivum Immunologiae et Therapiae Experimentalis*. 57 (1) 13-18. Retrieved from <http://link.springer.book> NAIT Library Citation Style (nd). APA style and guidelines and examples 6th ed. Retrieved from www.nait.ca>libresourcea.citation.apa_examples

Prytherch, R. J., & Prytherch, R. J. (1995). *Harrod's librarians' glossary: 9,000 terms used in information management, library science, publishing, the book trades, and archive management*. Aldershot, Hants., England: Gower.

Prytherch, (2000). *Horrod's Librarian glossary and reference book*

Swales, J.M. (1986). *Citation Analysis and Discourse Analysis*. *Applied Linguistic*, Retrieved from <https://www.researchgate.net/publication/238121809>.

Shibly,A. (2016). *Reference and citation*. Retrieved on 25 January, 2020 from www.researchgate.net > 305911163_Referencing_and_Citation

Sylvia, M.J. (1998). *Citation analysis as an unobtrusive method for journal evaluation using Psychology student research bibliographies*. *Collection Building* 17 (1): 20-28. Sylvia, M. and M. Lescher (1995). *What journals do Psychology graduate students need: A citation analysis of thesis references*. *College & Research Libraries* 56: 313-318.

Taylor & Francis Standard Reference Style (2010). *APA (American Psychological Association) 6th ed*. Retrieved from <http://www.apastyle.org>

The University of Toledo (nd), *APA style reference and citations*. Retrieved from www.Utoledo.edu>library>help>guide>doc>apastyle